

Vertical Progression:

| | |
|---|--|
| 6th Grade | <p>RL 6.7 Compare and contrast the experience of reading a story, drama, or poem to listening to or viewing an audio, video, or live version of the text, including contrasting what they "see" and "hear" when reading the text to what they perceive when they listen or watch.</p> |
| 7th Grade | <p>RL 7.7 Compare and contrast a written story, drama, or poem to its audio, filmed, staged, or multimedia version, analyzing the effects of techniques unique to each medium (e.g., lighting, sound, color, or camera focus and angles in a film).</p> |
| 8th Grade | <p>RL 8.7 Analyze the extent to which a filmed or live production of a story or drama stays faithful to or departs from the text or script, evaluating the choices made by the director or actors.</p> |
| 9th – 10th Grade | <p>RL 9-10.7 Analyze the representation of a subject or a key scene in two different artistic mediums, including what is emphasized or absent in each treatment (e.g., Auden's "Musée des Beaux Arts" and Breughel's <i>Landscape with the Fall of Icarus</i>).</p> |

Students will demonstrate command of the Standard by:

- Identifying the director's /actor's choices that stay faithful to or depart from the text or script
- Comparing and contrasting a filmed or live production with its text or script
- Analyzing the extent to which a filmed or live production of a story or drama stays faithful to or departs from the text or script
- Evaluating the choices made by the director or actors

Vocabulary:

- | | | |
|----------------|--------------|--------------|
| • Actor | • Drama | • Production |
| • Advantage | • Evaluate | • Script |
| • Analyze | • Faithful | • Story |
| • Compare | • Film | • Text |
| • Contrast | • Idea | • Topic |
| • Depart | • Live | • Version |
| • Digital | • Medium | • Video |
| • Director | • Multimedia | |
| • Disadvantage | • Print | |

Question Stems:

- Compare and contrast _____ (text title) with the filmed version of the story. Use specific examples in your comparison.
- Is the filmed version of _____ (text title) effective? Why or why not? Use specific examples in your analysis.
- To what extent does _____ (filmed production) stay faithful to the text/script? Were the choices the director made effective? Why or why not? Use examples in your analysis.
- To what extent does _____ (live production) depart from the text/script? Were the choices the actors made effective? Why or why not? Use examples in you analysis.
- How does the production differ from the script?
- Why do you think the director chose to depart/stay faithful to the script?
- Do you agree with the director’s choice why or why not?
- Evaluate the effectiveness of the media techniques used to portray the work.
- Select an event from the book and compare it to a scene from the production. How are the different and why?
- What senses were most stimulated by the production?
- What medium most impacts your understanding of the selected work?
- How does reading a story compare to the audio or video version?

PARCC Evidence Statement:

- Provides an analysis of the extent to which a filmed production of a story or drama stays faithful to or departs from the text or script, including an evaluation of the choices made by the director or actors.

Sample Instructional/Assessment Tasks:

1. **PARCC** – RL.7 currently does not appear on any PARCC sample assessments or in the 2015 or 2016 PARCC Released items. This does not mean it is not assessed, but only that no items have been released.
 2. **Achieve the Core** – [Grade 8 Literature Mini-Assessment:1984](#)
 - ◆ **Question 8** ([link](#)) **Passage** ([link](#)) **Video** ([link](#))
In the scene of the film version of *1984*, which detail of the text is emphasized through the actions of the actor portraying Winston?
 - A. the compelling nature of Big Brother’s speeches
 - B. the absolute control that Big Brother had on the lives of the people
 - C. the poverty that surrounds Winston
 - D. the exhaustion that Winston feels on a daily basis
- Correct Answer: B**
3. **Achieve the Core** – [Grade 8 Lesson: The Ransom of Red Chief](#)
 - ◆ **Additional Tasks**
View a clip from the film version of “The Ransom of Red Chief.” Then, with classmates, analyze the extent to which the filmed version of the story stays faithful to or departs from the text, evaluating the choices made by the director or actors.

Sample Student Answer:

After reading the short story, “The Ransom of Red Chief” by O’Henry and viewing the movie with the same name, it is evident that there were many similarities, but also differences between the two. Of course, the basic plot and characters in the film stayed pretty faithful to the text, but there were definitely differences in the setting and dialogue.

Clearly a director must make many decisions to adapt a short story to film and make it work for the audience. Sometimes it does alter the original story. In this film adaptation, the time of the story has changed from the late 1800’s to the early 1900’s as referenced by “Buffalo Bill’s show” and driving a horse and buggy (page71) to after 1908 when the first Model T Fords were driven. It seems like a small change, but in the text, Bill and Sam used the buggy or were on foot which added to their hardships as opposed to driving in the car to make their “getaway” and then driving to return the boy to his family. Additionally, the movie was thirty minutes long. This meant that instead of Red Chief doing a few horrible things to Bill like bruising him, and hissing in his ear when he was asleep, and trying to scalp him, the director added more events to stretch out the time. For example, Red Chief shot the men with a pea shooter and even tried to light one of the guy’s shoes on fire before the scalping. It didn’t seem necessary and didn’t really add much to the characterization or the conflict of the story. Red Chief was already truly annoying, and the guys, especially Bill, were truly annoyed.

Although some events and the setting were added or changed, being able to see the characters come to life and actually picturing what the town of Summit and the “camping” areas could be made the story very enjoyable. The characters who played the Red Chief, Bill and Sam portrayed the written characters perfectly. Bill’s pitiful behavior shines through in the movie, and the audience genuinely understands how hard it was for him to be terrorized by Red Chief. Red Chief shows how extremely mischievous he is by his actions, words and facial expressions. Instead of Sam narrating, he speaks most of it in dialogue, which does help move the action along. Much of the dialogue stayed true to the text and that added enjoyment for the reading audience. Although there was additional dialogue to support the extra events, it seemed to match O’ Henry’s style and seemed authentic. Finally, for movie-goers and movie-lovers, the use of a special effect, showing a “silent movie clip” to illustrate the parents supposedly weeping over their son’s kidnapping enhanced the visual pleasure. A written short story just can’t do that.

So it’s a toss-up! If you are one who always sides with the written word, you will pick the short story, and if you are an avid movie-aficionado, you will pick the film. Either way, it is an enjoyable experience; so why not do both!